

**TOWN OF DAVIE  
EMERGENCY MEETING  
DECEMBER 4, 2003**

The meeting was called to order at 5:08 p.m. Present were Mayor Truex, Vice-Mayor Starkey, Councilmember Crowley, Councilmember Hubert, Also present were Town Administrator Willi, attorney Andre Parke, and Assistant Town Clerk McDaniel recording the meeting. Councilmember Paul and Town Attorney Kiar were absent.

Vice-Mayor Starkey advised that she had been following the impacts related to the airport expansion issue. She indicated that at first, the Town had fought to obtain a seat on the Broward County Airport Advisory Task Force and was eventually successful in doing so. Vice-Mayor Starkey stated that the Town's Airport Advisory Board had worked alongside Save Our Shoreline, the cities of Hollywood and Dania Beach, and Audubon on the airport expansion issue. She indicated that Council had passed a resolution to oppose the south runway expansion until the master plan was updated. Vice-Mayor Starkey walked attendees through a PowerPoint presentation, which illustrated the airport expansion plan, mitigation efforts and neighborhoods that would be impacted by noise and air pollution. She indicated that the Town supported economic growth and responsible airport growth in the County, but wanted decisions to be based on an updated master plan. Vice-Mayor Starkey pointed out areas that would be affected by noise and added that the Town had asked for a single event noise contour. She advised that an estimated 21-36 acres of wetland on the east side would be potentially destroyed by the south runway. Vice-Mayor Starkey stated that the original runway plan was still on the table and spoke about various environmental groups which also presented their concerns in the Environmental Impact Study (EIS). She advised that the Town had requested information about alternative plans and their impacts. Vice-Mayor Starkey thanked the County Commissioners for going through the consultant, Leigh Fisher and Associates, to update the master plan. She felt the Town needed more time to explore all the issues.

Scott Marder, Chair of the City of Hollywood's Airport Advisory Committee, provided a PowerPoint presentation which illustrated the results of the recent Leigh Fisher and Associates study of the impact of the airport expansion on the community. He referred to various options presented in the study and spoke about future impacts on specific areas - including the impacts of no airport expansion. Mr. Marder advised of four runway options and their impacts including: 1) SR1 - a 9,000-foot south runway with unconstrained operations; 2) SR2 - an 8,000-foot runway; 3) SR3 - a 7,500-foot extension of the south runway; and 4) SR4 - a 7,200-foot runway. He advised that the noise contours extended a significant distance out toward the west.

Vice-Mayor Starkey advised that some mobile home communities such as Palma Nova and Everglades were not reflected on the analysis. She advised that information on these areas had been provided to the County. Councilmember Hubert also advised that about 1,400 residents in her district were not reflected in the study.

Mr. Marder spoke about noise contours and how they would be expanded, with and without operational restrictions in place. He concurred with Leigh Fisher and Associates' statement that the DNL contours masked the actual noise impacts and advised that single noise events had to be looked at. Mr. Marder presented figures on the numbers of people who

**TOWN COUNCIL MINUTES**  
**DECEMBER 4, 2003**

would be affected by the various expansion options in various cities with Davie having the largest numbers of residents who would be affected.

Brenda Chalifour, representing Save Our Shoreline, asked if money for mitigation efforts would come from the federal government. Mr. Marder responded in the affirmative; however, residents within the 60-65 DNL would not be eligible for mitigation efforts. He summarized the data and advised that all the expansion options provided for increased capacity along with additional time delays. Mr. Marder pointed out acres of parkland and open spaces that would also be affected. He advised that the south runway option would be the most expensive and spoke about options for increasing revenues in order to create funding for mitigation efforts.

Vice-Mayor Starkey stated that the fleet mix of aircrafts projected for future use would change after 2015, which would make the longer runway unnecessary - except for 1% of the aircraft. She advised that this information was presented in the Leigh Fisher and Associates study.

Mr. Marder advised that his Committee had initially proposed shorter runway options, but were advised that studies showed shorter runways would increase the noise impact for more residents.

Mayor Bob Anton, representing the City of Dania Beach, stated that Dania Beach stood in solidarity with the Town on the airport expansion issue. He indicated that Dania Beach would be dramatically affected and stood to receive the lion's share of mitigation efforts, as their homes would be bought out. Mayor Anton advised that he did not know until recently how significantly any decision would impact the Town. He indicated that he had attended the County Commission meeting and had concluded that the north parallel runway option was the least expensive, with the least effect on the environment and with the least effective noise mitigation. Mayor Anton felt the only drawback would be to start the process over, which would take another five to ten years. He stated that if the north parallel runway option was chosen, he would personally support limiting the approach corridor and believed other commissions would do the same. Mayor Anton indicated his willingness to share any information which would be of further assistance.

Councilmember Crowley asked what other portions of Dania Beach would be affected besides Melaluca Isles. Mayor Anton indicated that Dania Beach had much waterfront property to the west of the airport that was not planned to be mitigated. He stated that the problem with mitigation efforts was that they were based on comparable, waterfront, non-airport affected properties, which did not take into account properties of lesser value. Mayor Anton pointed out that mobile homes were not well insulated as noise traveled through easily. He stated that he had not seen where the County was reviewing this issue.

Vice-Mayor Starkey spoke about appraised value versus replacement value criteria used in mitigation. She stated that replacement of waterfront homes in Fort Lauderdale would be higher than appraisal value. Vice-Mayor Starkey advised that residences closer to the airport were generally mitigated first, followed by areas further out, if enough funds remained.

Mayor Anton advised that the Leigh Fisher and Associates report had quoted an estimated \$128 million for mitigation which would probably only take care of the Melaluca

**TOWN COUNCIL MINUTES**  
**DECEMBER 4, 2003**

area. He felt the County would have to use its powers of eminent domain or condemnation to take some properties. He also stated that Dania Beach would lose a significant amount of its tax base until property was re-developed into commercial or trade zones.

Councilmember Hubert asked if Dania Beach would make concessions to move some of its mobile home communities to other parts of the city. Mayor Anton indicated there were no such plans in place and stated that the city had no funds to mitigate.

Vice-Mayor Starkey spoke about support for the north parallel runway which would affect the Town. She stated that the Town had not taken a position to support any options presented so far.

Mayor Anton voiced his support for the Town and indicated that the County Commission had taken the rotated crosswind plan and the no-action part of the plan off the table. Vice-Mayor Starkey explained that the County Commission controlled the amount of airplanes that could land and had projected economic growth figures based on cargo, international fixed base operations and general commercial flights. She felt these plans clearly indicated how many more future flights would be added. Vice-Mayor Starkey felt the Town had to explore options to restrict growth. Mayor Anton agreed and he felt the airport did not need expansion. He believed the projected numbers were inflated and overestimated. Mayor Anton spoke about negative impacts to parks which were the last pristine areas in the County. He stated that according to the consultant's records, 80% of John U. Lloyd State Park and 60% of West Lake Park would be dramatically affected by noise from the south runway.

Vice-Mayor Starkey stated that hard choices needed to be made with regard to trading off wetland conservation areas. Mayor Anton voiced his support for the option that would be most palatable to the Town.

Mr. Willi spoke with reference to residential areas forgotten on the maps presented. He advised that about 2,100 residents, about a 35% addition, were not reflected. Mr. Willi stated that this figure did not include the 25,000 plus visitors daily who visited the South Florida Education Center.

Vice-Mayor Starkey stated that using the north parallel option, a single noise event went directly over the Park City East mobile home community. She indicated that the Nova complexes and Silver Lakes were not reflected on the study, as their residential component was not considered.

Neal McAliley, an attorney with White and Case Law Firm in Miami, stated that the Town would have to live with any decision on the runway expansion for decades. He indicated that the County's options would continue to allow more planes to land and advised Council to work on the assumption that the airport's physical capacity would be filled. Mr. McAliley pointed out that the numbers projected on the environmental studies only covered the first ten years of runway life. He felt it was important to take environmental projections and other assumptions with a grain of salt. Mr. McAliley advised that DNL numbers were simply averages which did not reflect the amount of times people would hear a plane daily. Mr. McAliley stated that mitigation meant condemning homes and he felt the Town should not sugar coat this issue. He advised Council to consider the fact that alternatives which seemed unacceptable were probably based on criteria that the Town had no input on. Mr. McAliley suggested redefining the criteria in order to have choices that were more acceptable.

**TOWN COUNCIL MINUTES  
DECEMBER 4, 2003**

He felt the biggest problem being faced was that the study was rigged to produce results that would maximize airport capacity to land more planes. Mr. McAliley stated that the County would not be able to build and operate the runway without FAA approval, because an FAA license and mitigation funding were necessary. He further indicated that before FAA approval, additional environmental impact studies were needed. Mr. McAliley felt a decision by the FAA would not be made until the end of 2005 or 2006. He pointed out that as the County could not afford to begin any work with federal funding, no construction would begin for a while. Mr. McAliley felt the long process would give the Town more time to consider the issues.

Vice-Mayor Starkey asked whether another EIS would be required if a shorter south runway were chosen. Mr. McAliley indicated in the affirmative and explained that an EIS was necessary before a federal agency could take action that would significantly affect the environment. He also advised that updated studies were required if any changes were proposed.

Vice-Mayor Starkey asked how long the process would take if another impact study were done. Mr. McAliley estimated that another draft would be presented in 2004, while a final study would be presented in 2005.

Barry Heimlich, president of the Broward County Audubon Society, stated that he had explored the expansion problem and its effects on the community using engineering analysis. He referred attendees to charts and maps which illustrated impacts to residences based on the various proposed runway options. Mr. Heimlich indicated that the south runway would present the largest impact, while the north parallel runway would present the lowest impact to Davie.

Councilmember Crowley stated he was not in favor of any particular runway option and hoped for more time to review the options before the County moved forward. Mayor Truex felt none of the proposed alternatives were acceptable and indicated that some County Commissioners realized that the options were not great. He suggested that the Town oppose all runway options as they all produced unacceptable levels of impact. Mayor Truex felt that Council should try to derail any options currently planned and added that mitigation was an important factor.

Mayor Truex proposed that the Town encourage the County Commission to look at what the acceptable level of damage was and to postpone approving any proposed plans until other alternatives could be created. Councilmember Crowley asked if a time frame should be recommended to the County. Mayor Truex felt the County Commission had to consider an acceptable level of damage, how many people it was willing to displace, and how many communities it would degrade. He stated that the Town should do whatever it took to protect its residents.

Vice-Mayor Starkey suggested that Council explore attaching a number analysis to create a replacement value and an appraised value average with regard to mitigation costs. Mayor Truex felt the County needed a plan to relocate people. Vice-Mayor Starkey felt the Town needed to justify actual numbers in writing in order to ask the County for specific answers about its mitigation and noise abatement plans.

## TOWN COUNCIL MINUTES

### DECEMBER 4, 2003

Councilmember Hubert voiced her concern for residents in her district who could not afford to relocate to other districts.

Mayor Truex asked if everyone agreed that the Town would not back any of the proposed plans. Councilmembers indicated yes. Mayor Truex asked if everyone agreed that the Town needed to address mitigation issues and affordable housing, and to study other mitigation ideas. Councilmembers indicated yes. Mr. Willi cautioned Council against going in this direction and felt that a specific numbers analysis would give the County more ammunition and data to make a decision. He asked how Council could place a value on a mobile home park and explained that the County was using very broad averages that could not be applied to Davie on a case-by-case basis. Vice-Mayor Starkey stated that Council had previously given the County information which led them to update the master plan and look into different alternatives. She felt that if the Town did its homework and provided real numbers, it would be easier to stand by its decision. Mr. Willi explained that the County used averages that worked against the Town. Mayor Truex agreed that it was difficult to put a dollar value on homes. He felt that if the Town could figure out where the County's numbers were wrong, it would work in the Town's favor. Mr. Willi stated that the numbers were probably 35-40% lower.

Mayor Truex suggested that the Town prepare a resolution indicating that it was reviewing all options. He suggested that the Airport Advisory Board be involved, preparing a flyer, and getting some residents from the Everglades and Palma Nova to meet with the County Commission. Vice-Mayor Starkey suggested putting up signs in front of communities and complexes announcing the December 9th County Commission decision.

Mayor Truex asked Mr. Willi if he could work with Councilmember Hubert on the flyers and transportation of residents. Mr. Will replied in the affirmative. Mayor Truex stated that he and Mr. Willi could work on the language of the resolution. Vice-Mayor Starkey suggested asking for specific information and working with the attorney. She asked about the existing resolution opposing the south runway and the current master plan.

Councilmember Crowley commended Mayor Truex and Vice-Mayor Starkey for their work on this issue.

Ms. Chalifour explained that her organization had presented the same issues before the County Commission two years earlier. She indicated that the no-action alternative was not on the table anymore and advised that the Town's best option was the north parallel runway. Ms. Chalifour advised that the political reality was that the County Commission would make a decision at the December 9th meeting. She advised Council to discuss issues related to mitigation, replacement costs and taking care of residents. Ms. Chalifour did not feel the County Commission would pay much attention to the Town's opposition at this stage. Mayor Truex pointed out that the Town was not saying no to all expansion efforts but wanted to look at different alternatives. Ms. Chalifour stated that the figures did not reflect the changes in flight tracks, and indicated there would be less impact to the north. She reiterated that the Town would be more seriously affected if no action were taken. Ms. Chalifour indicated that she was looking for the best option for everyone.

Mr. Heimlich agreed with Ms. Chalifour's statements that the County would most likely make a decision on the south runway. He stated that most of the Commission leaned

**TOWN COUNCIL MINUTES  
DECEMBER 4, 2003**

toward this option because considerable work had already been done on the south runway plans.

Stephanie Osborne, Airport Advisory Board member, advised that traffic over Forest Ridge had increased ten-fold and asked Council to push for noise abatement flight tracks over I-595. She advised that if the Town were disputing the Leigh Fisher and Associates report, it should consider using legal counsel.

Arnetta Davis, Vice Chair of the Airport Advisory Board, felt that the Town had to consider the financial aspect and stated that the County had done its homework. She did not believe the mobile homes would be compensated with federal funds and felt the Town needed to waiver on caution. Ms. Davis stated that protective measures needed to be established for Davie, regardless of what position the Town took. She advised that the Town state its needs, a time frame and provide some alternatives to have the County go back to the table.

Hertz Halperin, Airport Advisory Board member, was scared that the Town was considering passing a resolution stating it was not in favor of any suggested alternatives. He felt the County might choose to make the decision for the Town. Mr. Halperin asked Council if it were true that Davie would be responsible for mitigation costs. Vice-Mayor Starkey responded in the negative. She indicated that some mitigation funding could come from the FAA for severely impacted areas, but that outside of those federal funds, the County had to contribute the remaining monies, which were not available. She spoke about problems cities would face once their economic base was gone and spoke again of the mobile home communities that would be displaced, with no affordable housing available.

Mr. Hertz asked what the "restrictions" referred to earlier in the discussion meant. Mayor Truex advised that the restrictions were for a temporary time. Ms. Chalifour advised that the restrictions were simply a wish list and indicated that the FAA had not adopted any restrictions.

Mayor Anton felt that the resolution proposed by Council was a viable alternative; however, he reiterated that the County would most likely decide on the south runway. He suggested that Council ask the County Commission to consider an alternative that would be least invasive. He stated it was close to a 7-2 vote to choose the south runway.

Vice-Mayor Starkey stated she did not like any alternatives but did not want to cut the Town's nose to spite its face by picking one over the other. Mayor Truex felt the north parallel runway was not a better plan and felt the County had to come up with something reasonable.

Mayor Anton again voiced his support for the Town and added that mitigation funding was not available.

There being no further business to discuss and no objections, the meeting was adjourned at 7:04 p.m.

Approved \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Mayor/Councilmember

\_\_\_\_\_  
Town Clerk